



THE STATUS OF HIGHER EDUCATION, VOCATIONAL TRAINING AND APPRENTICESHIP FOR ARTISTIC DISCIPLINES IN LEBANON, ALGERIA AND PALESTINE

Technical Assistance Unit of the Med Culture Programme for the promotion of culture as vector of Human, Social and Economic Development in South Mediterranean Countries. EUROPEAID CONTRACT: ENPI/2013/335-088

by **FATIN FARHAT** (Palestine), **NOURDINE BESSADI** (Algeria),
MARIE ELIAS (Lebanon)

JUNE 2016



A programme funded by the
European Union

med culture
ثقافة
متعددة

www.medculture.eu

Hydea S.p.A. Via del Rosso Fiorentino, 2g. 50142 Florence – Italy

This report has been produced with assistance of the European Union. The content of this report is the sole responsibility of the Technical Assistance Unit of the MedCulture Programme. It reflects the opinion of contributing experts and can in no way be taken to reflect the views of the European Commission. The Med-Culture Project is implemented by the Consortium led by HYDEA S.p.A. (Italy) in partnership with TRANSTEC SA (Belgium), L' INSTITUT NATIONAL DE L'AUDIOVISUEL (France) and the ROYAL FILM COMMISSION OF JORDAN (Jordan).

The Med-Culture Project is implemented by the Consortium led by HYDEA S.p.A. (Italy) in partnership with TRANSTEC SA (Belgium), L' INSTITUT NATIONAL DE L'AUDIOVISUEL (France) and the ROYAL FILM COMMISSION OF JORDAN (Jordan).



TABLE OF CONTENT

	PAGE
01.0 Executive Summary	4
02.0 Research Question	6
03.0 Methodology	6
04.0 Report Boundaries and Limitations	7
05.0 Acronyms and Abbreviations	7
06.0 Background on Higher Education in Lebanon, Algeria, Palestine	8
07.0 Policy of Higher Education and VET in Artistic Disciplines	10
07.1 Distribution of Responsibility and Governance	10
07.2 Strategic Planning of Art Education	11
08.0 Mapping of Higher Education and VET in Artistic Disciplines	13
08.1 Institutes (Universities and VET)	??
08.2 Artistic Disciplines	??
08.3 Level of Education and Diplomas	23
08.4 Admission Process	23
08.5 Academic Staff and Infrastructure	24
08.6 Accreditation Process	26
08.7 Financing	27
08.8 Relation to Location Cultural Scene and Alternative Non Academic Art Education	28
09.0 Art Graduates' Challenges	29
10.0 Recommendations	29
11.0 References	32
12.0 Annex 1 (Interview Questions), Annex 2 (Questionnaires)	43

LIST OF TABLES

Table (1)	Geographical Distribution of Higher Education Institutions in Palestine	8
Table (2)	Higher Institutes and Vet Art Programs (Palestine)	14
Table (3)	Higher Institutes and Vet Art Programs (Lebanon)	18
Table (4)	Higher Institutes and Vet Art Programs (Algeria)	21
Table (5)	List of Interviewees in Palestine, Lebanon and Algeria	31

This report commissioned by Med Culture program investigates the current status of higher education, vocational training and apprenticeship for artistic disciplines in three Arab countries: **Lebanon, Algeria and Palestine**. The path through which the report saw the light was extremely challenging due to the difficulty in the researchers' ability to mobilize between the countries under study and within them.

Once again, as is the case with most research projects on the creative/artistic sectors in the region, the lack of statistical data and

research overshadowed the reporting process. Lack of governmental cooperation, in some cases also stood in the way of obtaining all necessary data. However, and in spite of the challenges, this research has managed to map the scene, identify the major characteristics and challenges facing the development of higher education and vocational training and apprenticeship for artistic disciplines in the countries under study and offer some recommendations to further enrich and develop the sector locally in each of the three countries, and regionally as well.



MAIN FINDINGS:

- **Unfavorable policy environments** for encouraging art education development in Palestine, Lebanon and Algeria. Higher education and VET in artistic apprenticeship programs in the Palestine, Lebanon and Algeria suffer from acute public support on the levels of policy, implementation, infrastructure (human and material) and financial.
- The approach to art education in higher education **continues to rely on traditional** teaching means and methods, and rigid lines are drawn between the different artistic disciplines rather than creating links and adopting a multi-disciplinary approach.
- Social perception of the value of higher art education is extremely weak particularly in peripheral areas that are distant from capitals and in main cities. In addition, **art as a profession and a career for young graduates remains to be socially objected and contested**. At the same time traditions, customs and restrictions continue to challenge the development of art education and the access to it with **a clear gender biases** against women.
- **The art graduates in Palestine, Lebanon and Algeria** are faced with the dilemma of how to further develop their artistic personal projects and to be integrated in

the work market to sustain a dignified living particularly in the lack of public effort to promote art as business.

- **The lack of specialized cadre and professorship in arts** in the three countries and the very demanding accreditation processes of new programs (in most cases) are standing in the face of the development of art education in general and certain artistic disciplines in particular.
- **Higher education in the arts in Palestine, Lebanon and Algeria** will not reach its full potential until art education in general education is properly introduced.
- **Regional cooperation** on the level of arts higher education is almost nonexistent.
- **Lack of specialized research and statistical data and impact studies** on art education in higher education are hindering the development process of the sector. In addition the scarcity of references/books/journals/articles in the Arabic language and the poor arts libraries are extremely evident.
- In most case, there is **no continuity between the art programs offered the higher education institutes and the independent cultural scene** in the country.
- There is a **growing exodus/drain of artists and art operators and art professors from the three countries to Europe and Gulf region** due to the lack of opportunities of decent, proper and long term employment in art education.

02.0

RESEARCH QUESTION

This report commissioned by Med Culture program investigates the current status of higher education, vocational training and apprenticeship for artistic disciplines in three Arab countries: Lebanon, Algeria and Palestine. More specifically the report intends to:

- Thoroughly map the different programs of the offered programs and degrees in higher education and vet programs, including credentials of teachers/trainers.
- Explore the procedures to obtain certification for artistic curricula and the procedures for introducing new modules, new disciplines.

- Offer Elaboration of conclusions with recommendations/guidelines for improving the situation in each country and regionally.

The definition of artistic disciplines included in this report consists of: music, drama, dance, cinema and the visual arts. In cases where art education is limited, a look into TV and media programs was necessary. Architecture is also included though in most Arab countries, there is a rigid separation between art and architecture as it normally follows the faculty of engineering rather than of arts and humanities (with the exception of Lebanon where architecture is a part of the fine arts faculties. In addition, traditional crafts are also highlighted especially in relation to VET education.

03.0

METHODOLOGY

The study for measuring higher education for artistic disciplines and certification relative to the cultural sector in Palestine, Lebanon and Algeria was conducted through the collaborative effort of three researchers in the perspective countries under study. The team consisted of Marie Elias (researcher in Lebanon), Nourrdine Bessadi (researcher in Algeria). Fatin Farhat (researcher in Palestine). The final report submitted to Med Culture program was drafted by Fatin Farhat. Due to the scarcity of academic literature, analysis, data and research in the field of art education, a mixed of qualitative and quantitative measures were adopted in the course of conducting this report outlined as follows:

DESK RESEARCH: the three researchers accumulated all literature available on art in higher education in Lebanon, Algeria, and Palestine ranging from official

governmental sources, EU country profiles, local governmental sources, NGO reports and independent researchers' studies and observations.

INTERVIEWS: the three researchers collectively identified a pool of researchers, educators, artists representing different geographic areas and different disciplines of arts education in the three countries. The pool was interviewed extensively as per the topics under questions.

RESEARCHERS MEETING: working days were also organized for both Fatin Farhat and Marie Elias in Lebanon and the attempts to organize a similar session in Algeria were hindered by the difficulty of issuing the necessary permits for Fatin Farhat to travel to Algeria particularly in the lack of cooperation with the Algerian Authorities with the Med Culture program.

04.0

REPORT LIMITATIONS & RESEARCH OBSTACLE

The general main limitation encountered while writing up this report is the lack of statistical data and the scarcity of research in art and higher education in general in the three countries under question. Thus, this report serves as a corner stone for further necessary detailed and regular updated work on the documentation, surveying and data collection and investigation of art education in higher education and in VET in the three counties under study.

The challenges encountered in the work differ from one country to the other. The vastness of the geographic area of Algeria and the lack of cooperation of governmental and other senior public officials in the country have made it impossible to collect / or have access to the

data necessary for the purpose of this report. In Lebanon and in spite of the relative small size of the country, the data collection was also challenged as the vast majority of academic institutions are private and autonomous thus abide by their own rules and regulations. In Palestine, and in the aftermath of the internal political strife and the subsequent division between the West Bank and the Gaza Strip, access to academic institutions in the Gaza Strip has become almost impossible and whereas the public authorities were very willing to provide assistance in the course of the reporting in the West Bank, it appeared to be much more challenging to access information and personal in the Gaza Strip.

05.0

ACRONYMS & ABBREVIATIONS

HE	Higher Education
PNA	Palestinian National Authority
oPt	Palestinian Occupied Territories
HEIs	Higher Education Institutes
AUB	American University of Beirut
LU	The Lebanese University
BAU	Beirut Arab University
DGHE	Directorate General for Higher Education
LMD	Licence-Master-Docorat (Algeria)
ISMAS	Institut Supérieur des Métiers des Arts du Spectacle et de l'Audio-Visuel (Algeria)
CNRS	National Council for Scientific Research
ACAC	Accreditation and Quality Assurance Commission

¹ <http://www.birzeit.edu/en/about/history>

² <http://www.moehe.gov.ps/en/About-the-Ministry/Brief-History>

³ Interview with Dr. Ms Sakeena Elayan (PhD), MOEHE

⁴ Interview with Dr. Ms Sakeena Elayan (PhD), MOEHE

⁵ http://eacea.ec.europa.eu/tempus/participating_countries/overview/lebanon_tempus_country_fiche_final.pdf

In Palestine higher education is relatively new. The first higher education institute was established in the year 1972 (Birzeit University) under the Israeli occupation. Soon after the establishment of the Palestinian National Authority (PNA), the Ministry of Education and Higher Education was established and was commissioned with the responsibility for managing the education sector in Palestine in 1994¹. Two years later, in 1996, a new Ministry was established for the Higher Education and Scientific Research. However, the two ministries were re-integrated in one entity based on a ministerial rearrangement for the Palestinian government in 2002, with the name “the Ministry of Education and Higher Education” (MoEHE)². Drawing strong links between general education and higher education and the realization that the two are interconnected and the development of one cannot be

accomplished in isolation from the other, were the reasons that motivated the re-integration of the two ministries in one³. In Palestine today there are 49 higher education institutions that range from traditional universities to university colleges, community colleges and open education centers⁴. The higher education sector, though develops rapidly, faces different challenges amongst which are the threat to its presence and operation by the Israeli occupation and the internal Palestinian strife, the inconsistent growth in the gap between the number of students and teaching staff, the inability to attract competent staff especially in the governmental sector, the insufficient funding, weak and repeated MA degrees and majors, minimal research and uncreative research outcome and the weak and under developed material infrastructure.

TABLE 1: GEOGRAPHICAL DISTRIBUTION OF HIGHER EDUCATION INSTITUTIONS IN PALESTINE

Institution	The West Bank	The Gaza Strip	Total
Traditional Universities	9	5	14
University Collages	11	4	15
Community College	13	6	19
Open University	-	-	1
Total			49

The relatively recent establishment of higher education in Palestine and the Palestinian Diaspora in the aftermath of An Nakbah have made Lebanon the main destination for Palestinians seeking higher education. In Lebanon, higher education is the oldest in the region and dates back to the establishment of the AUB (the American University of Beirut) back in 1866 followed by Saint Joseph in 1875, whereas the first and only public university in Lebanon (LU) was founded almost one hundred years later in the year 1951. Haigazian University was founded in 1955, followed by the Beirut Arab University (BAU) in 1960

in collaboration with the Egyptian university of Alexandria. Most of the higher education institutions currently running in Lebanon were legalised in the late nineties when the private sector flourished in a sudden and rapid expansion following the 15 year civil in Lebanon between 1975 and 1990 and which had a very damaging impact on the sector of higher education of the country⁵. The freedom and the independence of the Lebanese higher education are protected by the Constitution. There are 43 univestrities in Lebanon only one of them is public while the rest are private.

In addition, there is a total of eight universities and colleges that are officially recognized in Lebanon. The main law that sets the basic regulations for the private higher education in Lebanon was passed in 1961 through which the Council of Higher Education was established to license new higher education institutes. This decree does not apply to the LU which has its own autonomous body of governance as a public university.

The decree was followed by a series of others in most important of which is the 1996 (number 9274, 5/10/1996) forming a special committee to oversee the work of private higher institutes⁶. In the year 2002, DGHE (Directorate General for Higher Education) was established to regulate the operation of all private higher education in Lebanon. The tertiary vocational post secondary education is totally managed by the Directorate General for Vocational and Technical Education (DGVTE) and is not considered as part of the higher education sector. Non vocational higher education referred to as simply Higher Education is governed by the Ministry of Education and Higher Education (MEHE). It is also important to note the existence of a national body CNRS (National Council for Scientific Research) aiming to support and develop the Research activities in Lebanon.

The University of Algiers was officially created in 1909, finding its origins in the School of Medicine and Pharmacy which was established in 1859. In 1879 the Faculty of Sciences, and the Faculty of Humanities and Law. In 1909 these faculties were grouped with other institutions, to give birth to the University of Algiers. After independence, Algeria inherited a university organized in academic disciplinary faculties, characterized by a rigid partitioning. The University of Algiers had four faculties: the Faculty of Medicine, the Faculty of Science, the Faculty of Arts and Human Sciences, and the Faculty of Law and Economics. However, the Algerian Higher Education is the product of a long process of construction, development and reform which started in 1962, date of the recovery of the national sovereignty. This process began with the creation of Ministry of Education in 1963.

At the beginning of the national reconstruction in the aftermath of the liberation from the French, the few higher education institutions were located in the capital. From one University in 1962 - the University of Algiers - (with two campuses: Constantine and Oran), there are more than 90 institutions of higher education today that are distributed throughout the national territory, responding to the principle of local public service.

7.1 DISTRIBUTION OF RESPONSIBILITY AND GOVERNANCE

¹ <http://www.birzeit.edu/en/about/history>

² <http://www.moehe.gov.ps/en/About-the-Ministry/Brief-History>

³ Interview with Dr. Ms Sakeena Elayan (PhD), MOEHE

⁴ Interview with Dr. Ms Sakeena Elayan (PhD), MOEHE

⁵ http://eacea.ec.europa.eu/tempus/participating_countries/overview/lebanon_tempus_country_fiche_final.pdf

In Palestine, both MoEHE and MoC (Ministry of Culture) are considered active stakeholders with an important role in art education including policy formation and shaping and program implementation. However, until now, the role of MoC is primarily contained in the capacity building of art education institutions, training and cooperation with cultural NGOs working with students at the general education level and is in now way related to art higher education.

The Ministry of Education & Higher Education is responsible for overseeing and developing both of the Palestinian general and higher education sectors (including the artistic). Since taking over the education sector post the establishment of the PNA, the MoEHE has initiated many development strategies in collaboration with national and international partners and exerted great efforts to advance and enhance the educational process. However, art in higher education was never addressed on its own. MoEHE remains until this very present moment, solely responsive to what higher education institutes propose in terms of art education. All responsibilities attached to higher education institutes in the arts in Palestine are overseen by the MoEHE. There are three exceptions that will be discussed later in this report namely: The International Academy of Art- Palestine, Al Kasaba Drama Academy and PARC (Al Hara Performing Arts Training Center).

Higher education in Lebanon is provided by Technical and Vocational Institutes, University Colleges, university Institutes and Universities. Only one of them is a public Institution: the Lebanese University. Both the private and public sector are administrated by the Ministry of Education and Higher

Education, Technical and Vocational Institutes depend of the Directorate General of Technical & Vocational Education. University colleges, university institutes and universities depend of the Directorate General of Higher Education. Admission to higher education Institutions is based on the Baccalauréat libanais. Likewise in Lebanon, there is only one Ministry that oversees education, general and higher education. The Ministry of Education and Higher education. In Lebanon all higher institutes teaching the arts as explained above are the responsibility of the Ministry of Higher Education yet they enjoy a great deal of autonomy and independence and this applies to the institutes that teach art as well. The National Conservatory of Music and the Symphony Orchestra on the other hand are the only exception as they fall under the tutelage of the Ministry of Culture.

In Algeria the situation is at the opposite end, the responsibility of overseeing institutions of Art Higher Education falls fully under the Ministry of Culture and not under the Ministry of Higher Education. There is only a very hesitant educational supervision of the Ministry of Higher Education. With the exception of the Faculty of Literature and Languages of the University of Oran, which offers training on literary and theatre criticism, Algerian universities do not offer courses in the fields of arts and culture.

As the educational reform process launched in Algeria concerned only higher education institutes under the direct supervision of the Ministry of Education, arts higher education institutes that report to the Ministry of Culture were excluded from the educational reform process and were unable to follow the newly adopted License- Master-Doctorate (LMD) reformed system which has hindered the overall development of art in higher education in Algeria. It is only recently (in October 2015) that the Ministry of Higher Education

⁷ Broadly speaking, Algeria's higher education sector has been marked by two major policy reforms since its independence. The most recent of these – the adoption of the three-cycle degree higher-education framework known as the 'LMD system' (License/Bachelor-Master-Doctorate) – has been in place since 2004/2005. According to the DGRS-DT, the LMD system as a key driver for achieving this objective. Previous heads of the Ministry of Higher Education and Scientific Research (MESRS) also, and often, praised the LMD system for its capacity to produce human capital (<https://www.opendemocracy.net/arab-awakening/oussama-metatla/higher-education-in-algeria-reading-between-lines-of-lmd-reform>).

⁸ www.moc.pna.ps/strat2014.pdf

and Scientific Research has agreed to ISMAS (Institut Supérieur des Métiers des Arts du Spectacle et de l'Audio-Visuel) to perform in accordance with the License- Master-Doctorate (LMD) reformed system⁷.

ISMAS's students went on strike in 2013 to demand recognised degrees equivalent to those of LMD system consequently raising the level of training quality and enabling them to teach art classes in public schools. "We are supposed to also depend on the Ministry of Higher Education, while the arts training does not even appear on the list of choices offered to new graduates!" say representatives of students. Until now, graduates of art higher education institutes unlike other higher education institutes that follow the LMD system are not allowed to teach art in public (primary, secondary) schools.

This is standing in the face of art graduates to earn stable and dignified incomes and is affecting the level and depth of art education in general education and has led to a series of strikes and protests initiated by students. Their main demands were to establish the clear linking of their institutes of art education to

the Ministry of Higher Education and Scientific Research and the application of the LMD system. Graduation under the supervision of the two authorities, namely the Ministry of Culture and that of Higher Education and Scientific Research, was one of the main demands of the INFIDJART movement. This strike took place in spring 2015. Students of Fine Arts, the initiators of this movement, have expressed their desire to see the status of their institute revised to link it to the Ministry of Higher Education.

In his speech at the official opening of the academic year 2015-2016 of schools and institutes of cultural and artistic education at the Higher Institute of Music, the Minister said: The implementation of the LMD system in ISMAS is "a first step towards the resolution of problems of qualifications in other schools and institutes of artistic and cultural training in Algeria."

Meanwhile, all diplomas continue to be issued by the Ministry of Culture. Regarding vocational education of artistic disciplines, no ambiguity exists as the Ministry of Vocational Training issues all diplomas in the concerned areas.

7.2 STRATEGIC PLANNING OF ART EDUCATION

The Palestinian National Development plans (2011-2013) and (2014-2016) have clearly identified "culture and heritage" under the social sector and specified it explicitly following the strategic objective: "to safeguard and renew Palestine's culture and Heritage"⁸. But such a strong statement can actually be misleading for only less than 0.003 % of the National budget is dedicated to culture. Although the Culture Sector Strategy has allocated immense value on art education, evidence suggests that national funding subsidised for their implementation remains minimal and insufficient.

When examining the value of art education on the national level in Palestine, one notices that MoEHE has integrated some cultural elements that can constitute a reference point to the development of art education in general. Within the framework of ESCSS (Education Sector and Cross Sector Strategy), the importance of identity, culture and creativity and openness to other cultures, are all emphasised which subsequently make art education a tool for their fulfilment. However, and while MoEHE asserts that art is a core academic subject in theory and in its literature, there are no explicit national policies that

⁹The Palestinian National Authority, the Ministry of Education and Higher Education Sector cross Strategy (2011-2013), January 10, 2010 PP 57.88.

position art education as a key and priority theme for strategic planning⁹.

On the level of general education, although art education is of increasing importance in Palestine, there are several challenges in the field. For example, in schools, art is taught as a required subject from kindergarten to high school, however, there is no standard curriculum that all the schools can follow. Each school sets its own arts curriculum, which further depends on factors such as the budget allocated to art in the school, or the type of school, whether private, public or run by the United Nations, and most importantly the qualifications and expertise of the teachers teaching art. More importantly, not all schools take art as seriously as they take science courses.

Lebanon is an extremely unstable country of diversity and conflicts. Yet the cultural scene is regularly growing and lively. Until this moment, there are no clear and explicitly stated cultural policy/ies in the country and neither the Ministry of Culture nor the Ministry of Education have long-term visions equipped with appropriate strategies, this is not to mention the absence of a common policy that gives the artistic education a primary role. The art programs offered are the result of an internal will and desire by the academic institutes rather than a by-product of a national policy that is related to the market. "The absence of governmental support as well as the lack of understanding towards the importance of theatre being part of academic life in the Lebanese culture is obvious. The idea of deciding to change the education system in Lebanon in 1997 and the random decision of removing the art subjects from the curriculum after only two years were extremely reckless". (Assile Ayyache Arts Manager graduated from University College Dublin (Ireland) Master in Culture

Policy studies). Paradoxically there is a lot of creativity witnessed in the cultural scene, and there is this very energetic independent and alternative cultural community parallel to a quasi non-existent public sphere.

In Algeria, the cultural scene is experiencing a great diversity thanks to the wealthy sociolinguistic and cultural landscape of the country. However, the Algerian state is slow to develop a cultural policy that addresses this diversity and provides freedom of expression to the different potentialities. Indeed, there is no clearly defined cultural policy and cultural actors and artists continue to denounce what they call the policy of festivals whose cost is staggering but whose impact on the cultural life of the country is very weak.

Moreover, there is no clear strategic plan for arts education in Algeria, especially at the tertiary level, and which is distinct from that of higher education and Scientific Research. This can be explained by the fact that arts education in Algeria is still largely under the supervision of the Ministry of Culture. In addition art education in general education has been deteriorating from the eighties as a result of the political turbulences the country encountered for years.

In Palestine, there are a few universities/ colleges/academies in the West Bank and one in Gaza that offer art education degrees (bachelors) namely: An Najah University, Al Quds University, Dar Al Kalema College, Al Aqsa University, the International Academy of Art- Palestine and Al Kasaba Drama Academy starting the fall of 2016, Birzeit University. Sadly these universities do not offer programs in all artistic disciplines and the main focus of the certified programs remains on the visual arts while for example dance is completely left out. Most Palestinian universities offer a bachelor degree in architecture but it is not considered as part of the art programs but rather part of the faculty of engineering (Table 2).

Al Quds (Jerusalem) University department of Fine Arts currently offers a degree in fine art as well as a minor in graphic design and musicology. In addition, a new TV production major and filmmaking/ cinema minor were recently introduced into the university programs. Of course, all the programs listed are accredited by the Ministry of Education and Higher Education. In an interview with Ms. Laila Abbasi (Cinema Instructor at Al Quds University), she expressed responsibility towards the students joining the cinema modules knowing that the market is very limited and that most young graduates end up building a career in TV production rather than in Cinema. Thus, according to her, the need to turn the minor to major is unjustified unless parallel work is implemented to develop the filmmaking industry in Palestine.

An Najah University in Nablus offers a bachelor degree in fine arts, with the academic specialization in painting, interior design, musicology, graphics design and ceramics. Though this is the oldest and most established art school in Palestine and in spite of attempts of modernization and development, the programs are very strong in

technique but weak in creativity, imagination and in conceptual work.

Dar Al Kalimeh College in Bethlehem offers associate degrees in visual arts, glass and ceramics, contemporary fine arts, jewelry design, documentation and film, music and drama and theatre. Only in the last few years, did it start offering an accredited bachelor degree in visual arts and documentation and films. The college has also been trying to pass on four bachelor degrees in the Performance Art, Interior Design, Art Business and Management and Cultural and Sustainable Tourism. The programs are stuck in the official accreditation process.

The International Academy of Art- Palestine and Al Kasabah Drama School are also two academies that were established in recent years with the cooperation of art academy in Norway and Germany respectively. The International Academy of Art, Palestine was established following an agreement signed between PACA and The Oslo National Academy of the Arts with the financial support of the Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs in the year 2006. The official accreditation for the program is still pending and the academy has been suffering from financial obstacles as the funding from the Norwegian partners is decreasing along the years. The Academy's board made the decision not to affiliate itself with a local university early on with the purpose of maintaining independence from the pressure of the accreditation process, and to maintain autonomy over its educational vision and programs. Yet, presently and due to its inability to survive and the obstacles it's facing in responding to the needs of ACAC (Accreditation and Quality Assurance Commission), the Academy is negotiating with Birzeit University to join its faculty of Arts. The Drama Academy established in 2009 by Al Kasaba Cinematheque, aimed to fill the void of unavailable professional academic education in theatre and drama¹⁰. The Academy was

established in cooperation with the Folkwang Hochschule for Music, Theatre, Dance, Design and Academic Studies in Germany and uses its partner's curriculum with some adjustments made to suit the local Palestinian context and experience.

Ironically **Birzeit University** which is reputed for academic excellence and openness does not offer specialized BA degree in the arts, though the university offers some art classes to its architecture students and also some photography and lighting skill to its media students. A breakthrough was made this year, as an agreement was made between the Edward Said Conservatory of Music and Birzeit University to start the first academic bachelor degree in classical Arabic music in the fall of 2016. The music art education program at An Najah University offers through the Faculty of Fine Arts and awards a bachelor degree of 140 credits while the Department of Fine Arts at Al Quds University currently offers a minor in musicology.

In the Gaza Strip, Al Aqsa University runs a program of fine arts, photography, art education and interior design. However, the Israeli siege of the Gaza Strip and the internal Palestinian strike have had a detrimental effect on the quality and methods of teaching at the

University. The Gaza Strip has been isolated from the rest of the world, mobility to the Gaza Strip is virtually impossible, thus isolating Gaza and the art school and distancing the arts staff and students from new and contemporary trends and approaches to the arts.

Filmmaking is slowly developing in Palestine with three main programs: a bachelor's degree at Dar Al Kalema College, a diploma at the Women's Technical College and a minor at Al Quds University. Yet, most filmmakers operating in Palestine have either received their formal education abroad or gained their knowledge through joining different training programs offered by NGOs and international organizations.

As one can notice from the list below, vocational institutes in Palestine do offer art programs but most of the programs are linked to the applied arts and the very traditional forms of the visual arts (ceramics, design, Jewelry making etc). The Continuing Education Center – Birzeit University launched (in 2012) a pioneer diploma in animation with the assistance of the government of Belgium. Unfortunately, the high tuition fees requested from students to enroll in the course led to the program's termination and closure.

TABLE 2: HIGHER INSTITUTES AND VET ART PROGRAMS (PALESTINE)

No	Institution	Year Established	Geographic Area	Degree	Specialization	Year Established
1	An Najah University	1977	Nablus	BA	Fine Arts, Music Education, Design , Architecture	1985 1981
2	Al Aqsa University	1991	Gaza	BA	Fine Arts, Photography, Art Education, Interior Design	2003
3	Al Quds University	1984	Jerusalem	BA	Fine Arts, Theatre	1998
4	Hebron Polytechnic	1978	Hebron	BA	Graphic Design, Clays, Architecture, Marble Management, Interior design	2004 2009 1984

5	Palestine University	1982	Toulkarem	2 year diploma	Architecture Fashion design Interior Design	
6	Palestine University	2003	Gaza		Architecture	2005
7	Islamic University	1978	Gaza		Architecture	1993
8	Birzeit University	1972	Ramallah		Architecture Music	2016
9	Palestine Contemporary Academy	2006	Ramallah	BA	Contemporary Visual Arts	2006
10	The Drama Academy	2010	Ramallah	BA	Drama	2010
11	Al Quds University Bard		Abu Deis – Jerusalem	BA	Media TV Broadcasting Fine Arts	
12	Dar Al Kalimeh College	2009	Bethlehem	BA	Cinema Visual Arts Ceramics Jewelry Design Music	2006 2013 2014 2015
13	Palestine Technical College	1925	Ramallah	Diploma	Graphic Design Applied Arts Music TV and Cinema Interior Design	2015 Before 2002 Before 2002 2015
14	Science and Technology College	1990	Khan Younis	Diploma	Interior Design	2015
15	Ramallah Community College	1965	Ramallah	Diploma	Ceramics Jewelry Graphic Design Fashion Design Architecture	1984 2002
16	Gaza Community College	2004	Gaza	Diploma	Interior Design	2011
17	Hisham Hajawi College	2011	Nablus	Diploma	Interior Design Graphic Design	2005 2006
18	Al Azhar College	2000	Gaza	Diploma	Design	Before 2002
19	Arrawd Vocational College	1970	Nablus	Diploma	Interior Design	2013
20	Alummah College	1983	Jerusalem	Diploma	Graphic Design	
21	Palestine Technical College	1995	Arroub	Diploma	Graphic Design	2015
22	Palestine Technical College	1992	Deir Balah	Diploma	Fashion Design TV Broadcasting Multimedia & Animation	1998 1996
23	Wajdi Nehad Abu Gharbeih College	2004	Jerusalem	Diploma	Graphic Design	2012

Generally speaking, the disciplines of art education in Lebanon are in some areas limited in relation to interest and also in comparison to the growing number of the population and paradoxically in relation to the very dynamic independent creative art scene, though it seems that now more than before,

the academic system in Lebanon is adapting to respond to the new job market demands including the arts, cultural policy management. This tendency is most evident in both Saint –Joseph University (Master programs) and lately in Lebanese University in the Faculty of Letters and Human Sciences, where a

Master degree in cultural mediation is created at the French Literature Department, but also at Beaux Arts and in both universities there is a growing tendency to mix between the theoretical and practical knowledge (study cases field work medium term training.... etc). At Saint Joseph University, a master in art criticism and curatorial expertise is also recently offered.

Consequently many Lebanese receive or complete their formal education in the arts either abroad or through joining private education organizations or simply by private tutoring or through joining workshops occurring in Lebanon or abroad. This of course, applies to art in general education that is extremely limited. Despite the tiny geographic size of Lebanon there is a total 41 accredited universities, mostly private, concentrated in their majority in Beirut the capital. Their diplomas are recognized by the Lebanese government and 17 of the total number offer degrees in the arts. The Lebanese Public University has since the Lebanese war operated through many sections in Beirut and in the major five regions of Lebanon. This decentralization was a response to security and confessional reasons, and was not a result of a policy of democratization of culture. As many Lebanese students know three languages: Arabic, English and French, the academic teaching in Lebanon surf between those three languages. Ironically and in spite of this unintended decentralization, there is a centralization of art related academic programs in the capital Beirut and its surroundings. In reality, Few are the universities that teach arts outside Greater Beirut. Among these universities are the Lebanese University that has one of its campuses in Shouf Area, the NDU based in Zouk Mosbeh, Balamand University based in northern Lebanon, and only one of its campus

(Alba University) is based in Beirut and has a program in the arts. But art education in the Alba University branch covers all forms of arts expect of music, dance and theatre and the teaching methods are based on practice rather than on theory. It is interesting to note that the Alba University School of arts is the only school of which the diplomas are directly granted by the minister of education and do not need academic certification from the Ministry of Education.

As explained above, in Lebanon, there is only one public higher institute university which is the Lebanese University (LU). The LU has two faculties that teach art education namely: the Institute of Fine Arts, and the Faculty of Pedagogy, of course they run under the mandate of the ministry of education yet its jurisdiction is merely contained to "patronage". Presently, the LU is among the choice list for the new masters in cultural management and policy that is intended to start soon in collaboration between Al Mawred AlThaqafi- Cairo and the University of Hildesheim- Germany. All private higher education institutes that teach art in Lebanon must report to the Ministry of higher education yet enjoy a great deal of autonomy both administrative and financial and on the level of the content and methods of education. The LU is the only free university in Lebanon and private universities teaching the arts are extremely expensive and thus are not accessible to all sectors of society. The only higher education academic institutes that teach music in Lebanon are private and are the Antonine University and the Holy Spirit University. Thus most of the music education in Lebanon is received through private tutoring and teaching centers or abroad. In addition, some teachers/professors/tutors for professional and academic music education come from abroad due to the scarcity of local human

qualified and experienced capacities. Certainly, the National Conservatory of Music does fill in some gaps in music education both on the technical level and on the level of children and youth and it is affiliated by the ministry of culture. Its certificates are not accredited as higher education certificates. On another note, the faculty of pedagogy at the Lebanese offers a bachelor degree in Music Education which focuses on teaching music to children.

The Lebanese University (LU) is known for its excellence in theatre education while the ALBA and Jesuits Universities are best known for excellence in filmmaking and Visual Arts. In fact, ALBA's staff and students contributed in the launching of the virtual museum of modern arts where 2000 artistic pieces owned by the ministry of culture were displayed. An agreement between both parties was signed and ALBA was in charge of establishing the online platform. Students were involved in collecting information about local artists and interviewing them, all in order to maintain Lebanese Arts Heritage.

Many universities have had to close some art programs for the sake of sustaining another and due to the lack of demand by students, for example recently the USJ shut down its drama/theatre programs for the benefit of filmmaking and visual arts where demands on such majors among students is the highest, Haigazian University froze its Music Program due to the lack of the number of students.

Visual art and fine art courses at the undergraduate level are currently offered by seven universities¹¹ in Lebanon.

Undergraduate degrees in other art disciplines (graphic design, audio visual studies....) are offered by another 10 institutions. The teaching of all art schools remains relatively conservative and is mostly skills- based.

The most famous art school is Academie Libanaise Des Beaux-Arts (ALBA- Balamand University which is the first art education in the region and is the only higher education institution in Lebanon that is dedicated to the arts. Other popular options are: the department of Architecture and Design at the American University of Beirut (AUB) that offers two B.A programs one in Architecture and another in arts and graphic design. the LU and Lebanese American University. Most of these universities also offer a variety of MA art programs while the USJ launched a Masters Degree Curating Contemporary Art. A new MA in artistic interdisciplinary research and practices was also launched at ALBA.

Most of these universities also offer a variety of MA art programs (please see Table 3 below) while the AUB just launched an MA course in Curating Contemporary Art. A new MA in artistic interdisciplinary research and practices was also launched at ALBA. Dance as a major does not exist in any of the Lebanese private or public Universities. There are however few dance courses that are offered in the theatre programs at the Lebanese University. And most of the famous contemporary dancers/ choreographers started their career path as students in the theatre department. Ironically, the country that doesn't have dance as a major in any of its universities, celebrates contemporary dance, on yearly basis, through BIPOD (Beirut International Platform of Dance) festival where dance performances and professional workshops are offered. Many dance passionates, try to complete their education either abroad or either through special classes and workshops offered.

TABLE 3: HIGHER INSTITUTES AND VET ART PROGRAMS (LEBANON)

No	Institution	Year Established	Geographic Area	Diploma	Specialization	Year Established
1	Lebanese American University (LAU)	1835	Beirut	B.A / M.A	School of Architecture and design (Architecture, Interior architecture, interior design, Islam art and architecture (M.A), visual narrative (M.A), fine arts, graphic design, fashion design, Digital Arts and Visual Arts ¹²⁾ , Communication Arts (Performing Arts, Television and Film)	1971
2	American University of Beirut	1866	Beirut	B.A	Architecture, Art History, Studio Arts, Graphic Design,	1951
3	Saint Joseph University	1875	Beirut	B.A/M.A/PHD	IESAV (institut of scenic and audiovisual studies)	1988
4	Holy Spirit University	1938	Kaslik	B.A / M.A ¹³ / PHD ¹⁴	Faculty of Fine and Applied Arts (design and applied art, Architecture, advertising, sacred art, graphic design, visual and performing arts: theatre/cinema/ photography/ multimedia) Faculty of Music (Musicology, Solfeggio/Dictation, Music Education)	1974
5	Balamand-ALBA	1944	Beirut	B.A / MA	School of Decorative Arts: Interior Design, Design (product design), Graphic Arts and advertising (illustration, comics, art direction)	50's (interior design) 1975 (graphic arts) 1999 (design / product design etc)
				B.A/M.A/M.FA	School of Cinema and AudioVisual (tv, audio visual effects, production, film directing)	1987
				B.A	School of Visual Arts	
				B.A/M.A	School of Architecture	1943
				B.A /	Institut of Urbanism	1994
				Diploma	School of Fashion Design	2016
6	Lebanese University	1951	Beirut/ Mount Lebanon/North	B.A/ MA	Institut of Fine Arts: Architecture, Interior Design, Plastic Arts, Theatre, Audiovisual, Graphic Design and Visual Communication, Urbanism, Landscaping, scenography, restoration, Art and Science of Arts Faculty of Pedagogy (musical education and art education)	

7	Haigazian University	1955	Beirut	B.A	Music	2005
8	Beirut Arab University	1960	Beirut/Debbieh and Tripoli	B.A	Architectural Engineering	1962
9	Notre Dame University	1980	Zouk Mosbeh, Shouf, North Lebanon	B.A / M.A	Faculty of architecture art & design: Decorative Arts & crafts, Theatre & Dance, Performing Arts, Fashion Design, Graphic Design, Interior Design, Arts of Photography, Arts of Music, Musimedialogy, Music education, Architecture engineering	
10	American University of Culture and Education- AUCE	1983	Beirut, Shouf, South Lebanon, Bekaa, North	B.A	Faculty of Arts: Fine Arts, Interior Design, Graphic Design,	
11	Al Manar University of Tripoli	1990	Tripoli	B.A / M.F.A	Faculty of Architecture and Design (Architecture, design: graphic design, interior design, furniture design, photography, studio arts, industrial design)	
12	The Islamic University of Lebanon	1995	Khaldeh, Tyr, Wardanieh, Baalbeck	B.A	Interior Design, Graphic Design	2007
13	Al Kafaat University – AKU School of Fine Arts and Advertising	1995		B.A	Theatrical Sciences, Audiovisual, Advertising and Graphic Arts, Interior design, Radio and TV	1999
14	Arts Science and technology University in Lebanon -AUL	2000	Tripoli, Jounieh, Beirut	B.S	Graphic Design, Interior Design	2000
15	Lebanese international University – Faculty of Art & sciences	2001	Beirut, Bekaa, Saida, Tripoli, Akkar, Tyr, Nabatieh, Mount Lebanon	B.A	Graphic Design, Interior Design, Radio-TV	2001 2004
16	Lebanese Canadian University	2007	Antoura	B.A	Graphic Design, Interior Design	2007-2008
17	Lebanese German University	2008	Jounieh		Performing Arts	2008

The educational infrastructure in Algeria reflects the administrative and educational control shared by 4 ministries, namely the Ministry of National Education, the Ministry of Higher Education and Scientific Research, the Ministry of Culture, and the Ministry of Vocational Training.

Vocational training as a whole is divided into 4 networks, each with a separate structure: the network of public institutions for vocational training, the network of private schools, the network of public institutions affiliated to other ministries and the network of training institutions affiliated to commercial companies. However, Private schools and those affiliated to commercial companies offer no diploma courses.

In the field of culture and arts, vocational training is spread over 4 branches with 80 specializations: service industries (17 specializations such as domestic arts, the manufacture, maintenance and repair of musical instruments, hairdressing and aesthetics), traditional handicrafts (35 specializations such as sculpture (wood/marble), traditional clothing, calligraphy and book binding), audio-visual technologies (11 specializations such as photography, audio-visual techniques and maintenance of audio-visual equipment, all-round audio-visuals) and the printing industry (17 specializations like typography and printing).

In addition to the Ministry of Culture and that of Vocational training which has established various arts education institutions, basic art education is the responsibility of the Ministry of National Education, which is responsible for the programs of public and private institutions. As for out-of-school arts education; it is one of the tasks of the local communities, culture houses, NGO's, and youth centers. The disciplines that attract most attention are media (broadcasting), visual arts, audio-visual arts, music and theatre.

In terms of higher education, the infrastructure of artistic training is as follows:

INSTITUTIONS OF HIGHER EDUCATION:

- Higher National Music Institute
- School of Fine Arts
- Higher Institute of craft arts and audiovisual (ISMAS)

REGIONAL AND RELATED INSTITUTIONS:

- Regional School of Fine Arts in Oran
- Regional School of Fine Arts in Constantine
- Regional School of Fine Arts in Batna
- Regional School of Fine Arts in Azazga (Tizi Ouzou)
- Regional School of Fine Arts in Mostaganem
- Regional Institute of musical training in Algiers
- Regional Institute of musical training in Batna
- Regional Institute of Music Training in Bouira
- Regional Institute of musical training in Oran

TABLE 4: HIGHER INSTITUTES AND VET ART PROGRAMS (ALGERIA)

	Length	Artistic disciplines	Diploma	
Higher National Music Institute	4 years	Musicology	Degree of Musical Higher Education	
School of Fine Arts	5 years	- Graphic design - Design development - Painting - Sculpture - Ceramic - Miniature		
Higher Institute of craft arts and audiovisual (ISMAS)	3 years	- Performing arts - Visual arts	A degree (Licence)	
	Length	Artistic disciplines	Diploma	Annexes
Regional School of Fine Arts in Oran	4 years	Painting, Sculpture, Deco volume, Visual communication, Miniature decoration, Graphic design.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A first phase of three years of general training (core), culminating in the general certificate of artistic study. • A second phase of a year of specific studies, sanctioned by the national diploma in studies of Fine Arts. 	The school has an annex in Sidi Bel Abbes.
Regional School of Fine Arts in Constantine	4 years	Painting, Sculpture, Deco volume, Visual	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A first phase of three years of general training (core), culminating in the general certificate of artistic study. • A second phase of a year of specific studies, sanctioned by the national diploma in studies of Fine Arts. 	The school has an annex in Annaba.
Regional School of Fine Arts in Batna	4 years	Painting, Sculpture, Deco volume, Visual	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A first phase of three years of general training (core), culminating in the general certificate of artistic study. • A second phase of a year of specific studies, sanctioned by the national diploma in studies of Fine Arts. 	The school has an annex in Setif.
Regional School of Fine Arts in Azazga (Tizi Ouzou)	4 years	Painting, Sculpture, Deco volume, Visual	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A first phase of three years of general training (core), culminating in the general certificate of artistic study. • A second phase of a year of specific studies, sanctioned by the national diploma in studies of Fine Arts. 	
Regional School of Fine Arts in Mostaganem	4 years	Painting, Sculpture, Deco volume, Visual	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A first phase of three years of general training (core), culminating in the general certificate of artistic study. • A second phase of a year of specific studies, sanctioned by the national diploma in studies of Fine Arts. 	

Regional Institute of musical training in Algiers	6 years	Violin, Alto, Flute, Trumpet, Bassoon, Piano, Percussion, Oboe, Guitar, Saxophone, Vocals, Music Education.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The first phase of three years of general studies, which will serve to initiation and fundamental knowledge in music, and corresponds to the secondary education cycle. • A second phase of three years of specialized studies in musicology, which will serve to the deepening and consolidation of knowledge (theoretical, technical and methodological) 	The school has annexes in Annaba and Constantine
Regional Institute of musical training in Batna	6 years	Violin, Alto, Flute, Trumpet, Bassoon, Piano, Percussion, Oboe, Guitar, Saxophone, Vocals, Music Education.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The first phase of three years of general studies, which will serve to initiation and fundamental knowledge in music, and corresponds to the secondary education cycle. • A second phase of three years of specialized studies in musicology, which will serve to the deepening and consolidation of knowledge (theoretical, technical and methodological) 	The school has annexes in Annaba and Constantine
Regional Institute of Music Training in Bouira	6 years	Violin, Alto, Flute, Trumpet, Bassoon, Piano, Percussion, Oboe, Guitar, Saxophone, Vocals, Music Education.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The first phase of three years of general studies, which will serve to initiation and fundamental knowledge in music, and corresponds to the secondary education cycle. • A second phase of three years of specialized studies in musicology, which will serve to the deepening and consolidation of knowledge (theoretical, technical and methodological). 	The school has an annex in Bejaia.
Regional Institute of musical training in Oran	6 years	Violin, Alto, Flute, Trumpet, Bassoon, Piano, Percussion, Oboe, Guitar, Saxophone, Vocals, Music Education.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The first phase of three years of general studies, which will serve to initiation and fundamental knowledge in music, and corresponds to the secondary education cycle. • A second phase of three years of specialized studies in musicology, which will serve to the deepening and consolidation of knowledge (theoretical, technical and methodological) 	The school has annexes in Tlemcen, Bechar, Relizane, and Sidi Belabbes.

8.3 LEVEL OF EDUCATION AND DIPLOMAS

In Palestine art degrees are only offered in diplomas and bachelors. Doctoral and master's degrees in the arts are still not available. Thus, art graduates project outside Palestine should they wish to further pursue their education in the arts. Unfortunately, many of the available graduate scholarships to Europe (post peace process) focus on disciplines other than the arts (development, democratization, conflict resolution, women's studies etc.), thus making it extremely difficult for art graduates to further pursue their graduate studies in the arts due to the high cost of joining such programs abroad. Some exceptions are made by the British Council and Fulbright for artistic disciplines that encourage art/community studies. Many of the arts programs graduates opt to joining artistic residencies programs rather than joining full graduate degrees. Of course, there are scholarships available through the MoC and MoHE to some Arab countries particularly in the fields of music and drama. Prior to the Arab Spring, Syria used to also offer Palestinian students scholarships in the music and the performing arts.

In Lebanon the situation is a bit different, diplomas, bachelors and master's degrees and also doctorate degrees are offered in some fields of the arts. Yet again, this level of education is offered by private higher education institutes and is extremely expensive. In the presence of a very dynamic cultural and artistic scene and in the context of Lebanon's known openness to the world, and its regional role in the art scene, art graduates also opt for joining specialized workshops and regional and international workshops and training courses.

In Algeria, the duration of the training vary from one program to the other from 3 to 6 years and is divided into two phases: The first phase of three years of general studies, which will serve to initiation and fundamental knowledge in music, and corresponds to the secondary education cycle. A second phase of three years of specialized studies in musicology, which will serve to the deepening and consolidation of knowledge (theoretical, technical and methodological).

8.4 ADMISSION PROCESS

In Palestinian higher institutions that offer arts programs, the admission process is relatively easy and straight forward. A passed high school examination (Tawjih) is a must for admission in all universities however, in some colleges that offer a two year diploma it is not. Students are neither evaluated by their talent nor by true interest so normally, many students who join these programs do it due to the fact that their low scoring in the high school examinations forbade them from joining other faculties. This poses as a real problem as the students go through their diplomas with little to no genuine interest and

upon graduating, they don't make a career in the art scene. Of course, the admission process at both the International Academy of Contemporary Art – Palestine and Al Kasaba Drama Academy where students are accepted by presenting a portfolio of their work and by show talent and commitment to the arts. So will be the case with the newly established bachelor in classical Arabic music offered by Birzeit University in the fall of 2016 where students are expected to prove a certain level of competency in music while still abide by the general university admission process. At the Women Technical College in Ramallah,

admission also includes an orientation process that address both the students and the parents to highlight the value and potential of art education.

In general the number of students joining arts programs is extremely low. General programs allow for a total of 20-40 students per year and the number is lower in the two new academies where less than 10 students graduate each year. The numbers of graduates is higher in some VET programs (design and jewellery) however, other VET programs (such as music) are often shut down due to the lack of demand and admission as is the case of the music program of the Women Technical College in Ramallah . Foreign students (mainly from Europe) join Palestinian academic programs in the arts for limited duration and in the context of long-term international cooperation agreement (student exchange program between Toulouse Bozar and the International Academy of Art- Palestine). In Lebanon admission varies from one university to the other. The LB runs an open competition for admission in the arts programs. The reasons for doing so are not necessary to test the quality of the students rather to create elaborate ways of selection since there is an immense demand of admission to LU due to the relative low cost of tuition (Lebanese University has

only registration fees per year that vary approximately between 200\$ and 600\$ as opposed to full tuition in the private sector universities that may reach up to 30000\$ a year). The situation varies from one university to other among the private ones: some demand a portfolio of work will others demand an interview but all demand a passed high school diploma. The number of students joining art programs range between 20-50 per program and it is estimated that 10% of students are foreign students.

In Algeria, until recently, art education institutes used to admit to their programs students who have not passed the high school diploma or those who scored badly on the test. As a result, art education was not perceived seriously and thus no real efforts were invested to integrate art graduates in the workforce. In addition, many art students lack genuine interest and true motivation. This has changed lately. Currently, eligibility requirements vary from one institute to another but all require that the candidate holds a baccalaureate diploma or a foreign equivalent degree. In addition, all eligible candidates must pass an entrance exam. The duration of the training vary from one program to the other from 3 to 6 years. Education in Algeria is public and the cost is minimal to art and no art students.

8.5 ACADEMIC STAFF AND INFRASTRUCTURE

One of the main challenges facing art in higher education institutes is the presence of qualified staff. In the three countries, the higher education law demands that bachelor degrees are taught (for the most part) by Ph.D. Professors. This is a real problem since there is an immense scarcity of in Ph.D. graduates in the arts. This is one of the main reasons that many universities in Palestine and Lebanon teaching arts do so without official accreditation which proves to be problematic to their graduates who specifically would like

to enter the public work market.

In an interview with Dr. Nuha Khoury (Vice President for Academic Affairs at Dar Al Kalemh University), she stated that the college had to “show evidence of presence of agreements with foreign universities to bring faculty with PhDs once the programs are opened, several faculty members abroad studying to get a PhD or a higher degree than the MFA (which actually is the terminal degree for the majority of the fields we have, especially as they are practical fields), and also

hiring of Palestinian faculty members who are living outside of Palestine and now are with us and shall have their PhDs in 2016 (one from Magill university, another from Arizona University and another from Oslo University). In the case of Palestine and Lebanon, many professors are also asked to join from the 1948 to overcome this problem.

In Lebanon, there is no national standard for selecting academic staff. As clearly stated in the EU Tempus country report on higher education "it is a purely market-oriented exercise. In the Lebanese University, teaching staff can be hired on a contractual basis with a fixed number of teaching hours or on a full-time contractual basis, with a more stable contract that is renewed automatically every year or within the 'cadre' of the university. In the private sector, academic staff can be hired only on a contractual basis or within the 'cadre' of the institution". Many of the art teachers local and international are hired on contractual basis. However, it was also evident that the Ministries of Education in both countries and the universities themselves tend to act flexible in this regards. Often, acclaimed artists with BA or MA degrees or without are invited to teach art students with special contracting arrangements. The public authorities and university administrations tend to allow for such procedure in extreme cases with detailed justifications.

In Algeria, the situation is quiet similar. Indeed, there are no standards previously established for the recruitment of teachers in the arts institutes and the teachers' recruitment policy has not been updated in the light of new realities of the country. It is a decree dated on 27 January 1993 that continues to govern the personnel of institutions of art education in Algeria. Article 5 of this decree states that the sector of the higher education arts training includes the following body:

- Professors;
- University lecturers;
- Teaching assistants.

According to some students, many teachers, "although savvy teachers in their fields [archeology, anthropology, sociology, etc.], but have nothing to do with the fine arts."

Many observers agree that the recruitment of teachers in the arts in higher education in Algeria suffers from the same problem, that is to say the ambiguity that still exists on the ministry: the ministry of Higher Education or that of Culture. This fact has led to the export of artistic talent to outside Algeria and mainly to France. The poor material infrastructure is also a major concern in the three countries in particular with public universities. For example the LU is poor in terms of infrastructure whereas private universities such as the Jesuits and the AUB have large and well equipped spaces (theatres, workshop spaces etc). In Palestine, An Najah University has large facilities and so does Dar Al Kalmeh. Other colleges and vocation training centers, have smaller venues. Al Quds University in particular suffers from the lack of workshop spaces for its fine arts students. In Algeria, The lack of space and poor infrastructure has always been one of the elements put forward by students in their different strikes. According to many fine arts students, there is a glaring lack of space for workshops and the few existing rooms are not enough to hold all the students. But in general the universities and colleges tend to create new artistic programs without creating the necessary spaces needed (rehearsal space, studios, storage spaces, cameras, materials etc.). The problem is even more evident in the fields that require advanced and expensive IT equipment such as animation and filmmaking and recording studios. Often, the work spaces are neither properly lit nor properly heated as well. Most art faculties also lack specialized libraries that contains useful reference especially in the Arabic language.

8.6 ACCREDITATION PROCESS

In Algeria, as stated clearly in the Algeria Tempus report on higher education, the development of quality assurance in higher education is the culmination of reforms that were launched with a view to becoming part of the international drive for mutual recognition of qualifications and diplomas. In this context, the National Accreditation Committee (CNH) and the Regional Evaluation Committees (CREs) are responsible for validating Bachelor and Master degree courses offered by universities and authorizing these institutions to award the corresponding degrees. Doctorate courses are validated by committees established by the Directorate for Postgraduate Studies and Educational Research at the Ministry of Higher Education and Scientific Research. A national committee for implementing quality assurance in higher education institutions was formed in May 2010 in order to underpin good practices, help in developing and applying quality assurance mechanisms, carrying out assessment activities of objectives and outcomes and proceeding to self-evaluation of programs and institutions in order to prepare for national and/or international accreditations.

In the context of the art programs, a special national committee for the assessment of public scientific, cultural and professional institutions and other higher education institutions have been created according to executive decree of 21 January 2010. Their mission is to regularly assess, in accordance with the principles of objectivity, independence and transparency, all activities and actions of the institutions, in terms of governance, training, and research in relation to the objectives assigned to the higher education and training institution as part of public policy of higher education.

In Lebanon, no proper quality assurance and accreditation mechanisms are in place

at national level. Some higher education institutions have started to implement internal quality control within their structure; some are receiving accreditation from external international bodies in the USA and from Europe. The Ministry of Education and Higher Education (MEHE) has introduced some quality assurance procedures in their traditional licensing mechanisms intended for establishing a higher education institution. The licensing mechanism is applied at the MEHE through the Council of Higher Education and the associated technical committees. The process starts with the receipt of a file that ought to be analyzed by a special technical committee which produces a report and carries out some follow-up of the dossier. Based on the report from the technical committee, the Council of Higher Education issues a recommendation for licensing. The final decision on licensing a higher education institution is left to the Council of Ministers. A start-up process, followed by an audit visit or an on-site visit to verify the institution's compliance with the licensing criteria, leads to the recognition of the programs and the diplomas awarded to students.

The Palestinian quality assurance policy was upgraded in 2002 simultaneously with the establishment of the 'Accreditation and Quality Assurance Commission' (AQAC) as the only authorized agency responsible for the accreditation and quality assurance of Higher Education in the oPt. The AQAC is a governmental semi-autonomous body under the umbrella of the Ministry of Education and Higher Education (MoEHE) and responsible directly to the Minister. The accreditation process consist of three steps: Self-assessment: the process is initiated by the university itself then a self-evaluation process conducted by the faculty, the administrators and the staff of the higher education institution

or academic programs, resulting in a report that takes as its reference the set of standards of AQAC. Peer review: a study visit conducted by a team of peers selected by the AQAC, which reviews the documentation, reviews the premises, and interviews the academic and administrative staff, resulting in an assessment report including a recommendation to the AQAC. In an interview with Mr. Eyad Abu Seraj, he stated clearly that one of the problems facing act in accrediting art programs is the difficulty in the identification external experts in all fields of arts. Decision-making: examination by the AQAC board on the basis of a given set of criteria concerning quality and resulting in a final judgment and the communication of the formal decision to the institution and other concerned parties. The process of accrediting a new program could take a full year. To minimize duplication in programs, the present minister of education Dr. Sabri Saidam (Minister of Education), gave order not to accredit any new program that is already offered by existing universities and faculties and this decision was welcomed by VET offering programs in the arts in particular as the market demand on many applied artistic disciplines is limited.

8.7 FINANCING

In Palestine financial resources dedicated to art education by the Ministry of Education and Higher Education and the Ministry of Culture remain diffident. Estimates of art education teaching varies of course from one university to another and from one field to the other. In universities for example, an estimated cost of 4000-6000 \$ per student per year, the cost is lower in collages of course. The independent academies are supported financially by the government of Norway and Germany and Dar Al Kalmeh is supported by different international donors and churches thus the students bare minimum cost.

It is important to note that both the International Academy of Art – Palestine and the Al Kasaba Dram Academy (the two main avangard art schools) are still not accredited by AQAQ due to their inability and unwillingness to abide by the strict criteria imposed by AQAQ.

The case of PARC is worth address. PARC (Al Harah Performing Arts Training Center) was established with the aim of offering a diploma in lighting design and technique, sound design and technique, costume design and making, scenography design and making, stage management, and managing and producing cultural artistic projects. Since Al Hara Theatre is a registered NGO and not an academic institution, it could not gain accreditation to its program through the ministry of education and higher education. Exceptionally and as a result of strong lobbying for the future benefit of the students, the program was accredited exceptionally by the Ministry of Culture.

In Lebanon, the LU tuition cost ranges between 200\$ and 600\$ per year. However, private universities are extremely expensive and the cost of higher education in Lebanon can go up to 30,000 \$ per year. Public funding for higher education is many channeled into the LB whereas the other private universities relay on student tuition in addition to international and some religious institutions' funding.

In Algeria the government finances all academic insinuations including art higher education and thus art education is financially accessible.

8.8 RELATION TO LOCATION CULTURAL SCENE AND ALTERNATIVE

Non Academic Art Education

Unfortunately in both Lebanon and Palestine, private art programs are the ones that are better engaged in the local cultural scene in the two countries. The International Academy of Art- Palestine has been engaged with the street festival Wein a Ramallah and is a partner to the Qalandiya International Biennale of Art and Architecture. The students of Al Kasaba School have also been active in many theatre trainings and festivals run by the NGO. Dar Al Kalmeh in Bethlehem is also engaged in film festivals (Days of Cinema run by FilmLab Palestine) and other training workshops in filmmaking. Vet art programs are less involved. There has been attempts in particular by the City of Ramallah to engage the students of art programs in Ramallah colleges in the children's festival Nawwar Nissan but the cooperation is not always successful.

In addition, the colleges do not encourage their students to attend/participate in the numerous cultural activities that take place in the city which are in fact open to the public with free admission. A. M Qattan Foundation also supports workshops and maser classes (i.e Ramallah Doc, the Summer Drama School, the Summer performing Arts School) and also offers financial aid to students who wish to pursue their post graduate studies in the arts abroad.

In Lebanon, graduates of TV and multimedia and drama are more engaged with TV productions due to the presence of a very strong private TV sector. In both Lebanon and Palestine, art education (with high level of excellence) is also challenged through active local NGOs. Below is a list of the most prominent of them:

PALESTINE:

- Young Artists Forum- visual arts
- Al Hoash Art Court- visual arts

- Ashtar for Theatre Production and Training- drama
- Yes Theatre- drama
- The Freedom Theatre - drama
- Al Hara Theatre- drama
- Orient Center for Dance- dance
- Sirryet Ramallah Dance School- dance
- The Popular Art Center- Dance School- dance
- Ramallah Ballet Center - dance
- Episcopal Technical Vocational Training - dance
- Palestine Circus School- circus
- Al Kamanjati Music Association- music
- Sabreen Association for Artistic Development – music
- Edward Said Conservatory of Music- Music
- Gaza Music School- Music

LEBANON:

- Cirqu'en ciel- Circus
- Lebanon Dance Academy- Dance
- Beirut Dance StudioArt and Movement Dance School- Dance
- Ecole de musique Ghassan Yammine - Music
- Amadeus- Music
- Ashkal Alwan- Visual arts
- Beirut DC
- Zoukak
- Maqamat

ALGERIA:

- Association Etoile Culturelle d'Akbou
- Association Al Amel pour la Création Artistique et Culturelle
- Association Vitamine DZ
- Action Culturelle Algérienne
- Forum Art & Media
- Coopérative Nacéaa Belaza
- Ecole Artissimo Alger
- Association Numydia d'Oran
- Ecole Autograph Alger

1. Lack of feasibility studies which provide university and medium-arts colleges on the integration of art graduates in the work force and that allow for the identification needs of the local market in each country and work market of neighboring Arab markets, especially the Gulf region (where a new art scene is emerging).
2. Graduates sometimes are forced to work in areas distant from their specialization due to a lack of demand in the local market.
3. The lack of the required practical and theoretical knowledge and competencies' compatibility is in the market. Lack of knowledge in contemporary trends and methods makes it more difficult to be integrated in the local and regional cultural scene and pursue a career as artists.
4. The lack of practical internships before graduation locally, regionally and internationally.
5. The inability of applied arts students to be integrated in the crafts since as most of the business are family run for generations.
6. Lack of will in the Ministries of Education to appoint art graduates as teachers of art classes in public schools where art classes in general education continue to be run by non-specialized teachers.
7. Inability of graduates of non-accredited art programs to find proper employment in the public sector.

MAIN FINDINGS:

- Unfavorable policy environments for encouraging art education development in Palestine, Lebanon and Algeria. Higher education and VET in artistic apprenticeship programs in the Palestine, Lebanon and Algeria suffer from acute public support on the levels of policy, implementation, infrastructure (human and material) and financial.
- Social perception of the value of higher art education is extremely weak particularly in peripheral areas that are distant from capitals and in main cities and art as a profession remains to be objected and contested, at the time that cultural customs and restrictions continue to challenge the development of art education and the access to it with a clear gender biases against women.
- The approach to art education in higher education remains to be traditional and rigid lines are drawn between the different artistic disciplines rather than creating links and adopting multi-disciplinary as an approach.
- The art graduates in Palestine, Lebanon and Algeria are faced with the dilemma of how to further develop their artistic personal projects and to be integrated in the work market to sustain a dignified living particularly in the lack of public effort to promote art as business.
- The lack of specialized cadre and professorship in arts in the three countries and the very demanding accreditation

processes of new programs (in most cases) are standing in the face of the development of art education in general and certain artistic disciplines in particular.

- Higher education in the arts in Palestine, Lebanon and Algeria will not reach its full potential until art education in general education is properly introduced.
- Regional cooperation on the level of arts higher education is almost nonexistent.
- Lack of specialized research and statistical data and impact studies on art education in higher education are hindering the development process of the sector. In addition the scarcity of references/books/journals/articles in the Arabic language and the poor arts libraries are extremely evident.
- In most case, there is no continuity between the art programs offered the higher education institutes and the independent cultural scene in the country.

ON THE LEVEL OF POLICY AND GOVERNANCE:

- Necessity to lobby for the development of national long term strategies for art education in higher education (on the level of general education and the level of higher education) in the Palestine, Lebanon and Algeria in collaboration with all relevant stakeholders that can be translated into annual action plans viable for implementation.
- Development of a strategic and comprehensive database on art education in the three perspective countries.
- Development of community based campaigns and program to raise awareness on the value of art education, its relations to sustainable development and future employability.
- A thorough examination of the curricula and the different modules taught (theoretical and practical) at the different higher education art institutes by discipline.
- The empowerment of staff, administration and teachers working in the field of higher education.
- The development of entrance process and criteria to include procedures that measure students' potential in the following areas: general knowledge of the arts, creativity, research skills, talent.
- Working towards eliminating the strict and definite lines drawn between various creative fields such as drawing and three-dimensional imaging, sculpture, art installation, music, theater, cinema, video art, art criticism and creative writing in line new trends and artistic developments.
- Avoid the strict definition of the tools and materials and methods used while teaching, and harness all possible efforts in order to bring out creativity without limitation in the narrow frameworks and techniques.
- To encourage studies and research in the different fields of arts and artistic expression, and the public dissemination of cultural awareness by creating quarterly periodicals and publications.
- To raise interest in the aesthetics of the local environment through engagement with relevant institutions such as the Ministry of Culture and the NGO sector.
- To found specialized technical and experienced artistic committees to oversees the planning, implementation, follow-up in the Ministry of Education and Higher Education and not limiting it to only the administrative jurisdiction.
- To engage the arts students (and teachers) in the local, regional and international art scene through internships, exchange programs and joint projects.

ON THE LEVEL SPACES AND MATERIAL INFRASTRUCTURE:

- Upgrading the teaching venues while taking into consideration imposing binding regulations on universities, colleges, workspaces and suitability for a number of students and provide the necessary equipment and machinery and material of storage material in place.
- Developing the infrastructure for digital arts and new multimedia, animation, etc.
- The establishment of specialized arts libraries so that contain references important in the world in English and Arabic, communication and the European leagues centers for the donation of books and references, documentaries etc.
- Start new programs in missing disciplines such as dance and animation, and regularly develop the exiting arts programs through up grading curricula and teaching techniques.

ON THE REGIONAL AND INTERNATIONAL LEVELS:

- Create regional networks between art universities and vocational trainings to allow for exchange of knowledge and experience, students and staff.
- Foster exchange between art academies in the three countries and international academies through university exchange programs and through cultural and academic cooperation between the different cities.

TABLE 5: LIST OF INTERVIEWEES IN PALESTINE, LEBANON AND ALGERIA

NAME	POST	INSTITUTE	COUNTRY
Djamel Ghazi	Director	Institut National Supérieur de Musique (Higher National Music Institute)	Algeria
Mrs. Boukhobza	Secretary of Direction	ISMAS	Algeria
Massinissa Djoudi	Student	ISMAS	Algeria
Nourredine Kaddour	Professor	ISMAS	Algeria
Ahmed Bachir Cherif	Professor	College of Fine Arts in Algiers	Algeria
Amir Frik	Actor and former student	ISMAS	Algeria
Walid Aidoud	Professor	Regional College of Fine Arts in Tipaza	Algeria
Mohamed Yamo	Designer and former Student	College of Fine Arts in Algiers	Algeria
Lila Abbasi	Cinema Instructor – Film Maker	Al Quds University	Palestine
Mai Ibeih	Resource Development Officer	Technical College UNRWA	Palestine
Suheil Khoury	Head of National Conservatory for Music	Edward Said Conservatory of Music	Palestine
Marwan Tarazi	Director General	Continuing Education Birzeit University	Palestine
Dr. Mohammad Jaber	Dean of Faculty of Arts	Najah University	Palestine
Marina Barham	Director, Training Center	Al Hara Theatre	Palestine
George Ibrahim	Director	Theatre Academy Ramallah	Palestine
Nuha Khoury	Director	Dar El Khalimeh College Bethlehem	Palestine
Eyad Abu Seraj	Department Director	Ministry of Education and Higher Education ACAC	Palestine

Ajuni, Salem (2010) West Bank and Gaza Strip Population Census of 2007:

Briefing Paper January 2010. Available at www.unrwa.org, accessed 7 June 2010.

Amirsadeghi, H. and Mikdadi, S. (2011).**New Vision:**

Arab Contemporary Art in the 21st Century. London: Transglobe Publishing Ltd.

Ankori, G. (2006), Palestinian Art. London:

Reaktion Books. ISBN-10: 1861892594

Barthe, B. (2012).Ramallah Dream:

Voyage au coeur du mirage Palestinien. Tripoli: jarrous Press (Arabic Edition. translated by Khoury, S.)

Boullata, K. (2009), Palestinian Art: From 1850 to the Present. Beirut:

Saqi Books. ISBN-10: 0863566480

Donor Opium: the impact of international aid to Palestine. (2012) video. Directed by Shahin, M. and Azar, G. Palestine: Rosa Luxemburg Foundation

Dahbour, Ahmad, "Palestinian Cultural Project and its Future Strategies, p. 28,

Laida-Hanieh, Adila (2008) "Paradigm Shift: Building Inclusive Cultural Practices." Available at: <http://medreflection.eurocult.org>. An abstract of this essay appeared in: Odile Chenal, Susanne Mors, Mark Snijder and Hanneloes Weeda (Eds.) An Alternative Gaze: A Shared Reflection on Cross-Mediterranean Cooperation in the Arts. Amsterdam: European Cultural Foundation, 30-33.

Makhoul, B. and Hon, G., (2013) The Origins of Palestinian Art. Liverpool: Liverpool University Press

Marchart, O. (1999). Art, Space and the Public Sphere(s): Some basic observations on the difficult relation of public art, urbanism and political theory. Stadtmotiv. Vienna. Viewed online through European Institute for progressive Cultural Policies [<http://eipcp.net/transversal/0102/marchart/en>] [viewed on 5/10/2013]

Nashif, E., (2012).The Architecture of Loss: The question of contemporary Palestinian Culture. Beirut: Dar al Farabi, (Arabic).

National Democratic Institute for International Affairs (1996) The First

Months of the Palestinian Legislative Council. Washington. Available at <http://www.ndi.org/node/13905>, cited in Fact Sheet Palestine Political Process and Parties, available at: <http://www.centerpeace.org/factsheets/fact-sheet-Palestine>.

Raunig, G. and Ray, G. (2009). Art and Contemporary Critical Practice. London, MayFlyBooks. [available online at http://mayflybooks.org/?page_id=20]. ISBN (PDF) 978-1-906948-03-0). [viewed on 1/03/2014]

Toukan, H. (May 2013). On Being 'The Other' In Post-Civil War Lebanon: Aid and the Politics of Art in Processes of Contemporary Cultural Production in online platform Ibraaz [<http://www.ibraaz.org/essays/63>] [viewed on 12/04/2014]

Tawil, Helga (2005) "Coming Into Being and Flowing Into Exile: History and Trends in Palestinian Film-Making." In: Nebula, Vol. 2, No. 2, June, 113-140.

UNESCO (1999) Study on Palestinian Cultural Policy. Paris: UNESCO, Programme of Action in Favour of the Palestinian People.

World Bank Technical Team (2007) Movement and Access Restrictions in the West Bank: Uncertainty and Inefficiency in the Palestinian Economy. Available at: <http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTWESTBANKGAZA/Resources/WestBankrestrictions9Mayfinal.pdf>

Zarur, Kathy (2008) "Palestinian Art and Possibility: Made in Palestine, an Examination." In: Nebula, Vol.5. No. 3, September, 59-59.

Zvi, Tal Ben (2006) Contemporary Palestinian Art. Jaffa: Hagar Art Gallery. Available at: www.hagar-gallery.com, accessed: 3 June 2010

ALGERIA:

<http://www.liberte-algerie.com/culture/la-formation-artistique-en-crise-32405>

<http://www.racines.ma/sites/default/files/Arab%20Cultural%20Policies%20by%20Al%20Mawred%20.pdf>

<http://www.aps.dz/culture/29341-l-ismas-qualifi%C3%A9-pour-enseigner-suivant-le-syst%C3%A8me-l-m-d>

<http://fr.africatime.com/algerie/articles/rencontre-des-etablissements-de-formation-artistiques-batna>

http://www.huffpostmaghreb.com/2015/04/29/esba-infidjart-greve-faim_n_7169588.html

<http://www.m-culture.gov.dz/mc2/fr/formation1.php>

Staifi, M, 2016, «Conférence nationale des universités et d'évaluation du LMD, La gouvernance, talon d'Achille de la réforme», El Watan (13.01.2016).

ANNEX 1 (QUESTIONNAIRES)
ANNEX 2 (INTERVIEW QUESTIONS)

A) QUESTIONS TO HIGHER EDUCATION AND VET PERSONAL

1- What are the accredited or / non accredited art programs at your institute.

2- Do you offer art education at the level of BA, MA, and PhD?

3- How cooperate is the public sector in supporting the development of Art programs at your institute (policy, funding, flexibility).

4- Please describe the accreditation process of an art program at your institute.

5- Are the programs offered attractive to students? Male, females?

6- Please provide an overview of the staff teaching the different art modules (background, education).

7- How engaged is your institutes with the art scene in your city and in the country as a whole?

8- Do you follow the career paths of your art graduates?

9- Do you collaborate with regional or international art schools?

10- What are the main challenges that face the development of art in higher education and VET in your country?

11- What are your recommendation for the development of art in higher education and VET in your country?

B) TO ARTISTS AND PRACTITIONERS - Questions for artists and practitioners

1- How do you assess art in higher education and VET in your country?

2- The local artists you work with, were they educated at higher education and VET in your country, trained by art NGOs? Aboard? Others?

3- How cooperative is the public sector in supporting the development of Art programs at your institute (policy, funding, flexibility).

4- How engaged is art program in higher education and VET with your work?

5- What are the main challenges that face the development of art in higher education and VET in your country?

6- What are your recommendation for the development of art in higher education and VET in your country?
